Check for updates

Unravelling the role of epigenetics in reproductive adaptations to early-life environment

Ben Bar-Sadeh¹, Sergei Rudnizky¹, Lilach Pnueli¹, Gillian R. Bentley², Reinhard Stöger³, Ariel Kaplan¹ and Philippa Melamed¹

Abstract Reproductive function adjusts in response to environmental conditions in order to optimize success. In humans, this plasticity includes age of pubertal onset, hormone levels and age at menopause. These reproductive characteristics vary across populations with distinct lifestyles and following specific childhood events, and point to a role for the early-life environment in shaping adult reproductive trajectories. Epigenetic mechanisms respond to external signals, exert long-term effects on gene expression and have been shown in animal and cellular studies to regulate normal reproductive function, strongly implicating their role in these adaptations. Moreover, human cohort data have revealed differential DNA methylation signatures in proxy tissues that are associated with reproductive phenotypic variation, although the cause-effect relationships are difficult to discern, calling for additional complementary approaches to establish functionality. In this Review, we summarize how adult reproductive function can be shaped by childhood events. We discuss why the influence of the childhood environment on adult reproductive function is an important consideration in understanding how reproduction is regulated and necessitates consideration by clinicians treating women with diverse life histories. The resolution of the molecular mechanisms responsible for human reproductive plasticity could also lead to new approaches for intervention by targeting these epigenetic modifications.

The reproductive-endocrine axis is dynamic and responds to multiple environmental signals that provide the plasticity for optimization of reproductive success over an individual's lifespan^{1,2}. The mechanisms governing and regulating this adaptability are not fully understood; however, changes in the regulatory epigenetic landscape (BOX 1) undoubtedly have a central role. The epigenome is responsive to external signals and is able to modify gene expression patterns and networks³, thereby enabling changes in reproductive function in response to differing environments (BOX 2). However, the effects of early-life circumstances on adult reproductive function vary, depending both on the timing of events relative to 'windows of susceptibility', and between individuals growing up in industrialized settings and those in the developing world who have very different lifestyles⁴⁻⁹. This plasticity and the precise nature of the altered reproductive traits probably depend on resource availability and clearly involve interactions between multiple physiological systems¹⁰⁻¹³.

The role of the epigenome in the central control of reproduction has been the focus of several studies

utilizing animal and cell models over the past decade or so^{14–28}, the findings of which comprise the basis of our current understanding on how adaptive reproductive strategies can be implemented. However, a reciprocal interaction also exists whereby reproductive hormones affect the epigenome and epigenetic ageing²⁹⁻³⁴, which complicates distinguishing cause from effect. This ambiguity is especially important when trying to understand regulatory processes from human data, in which experimental work and tissue accessibility are limited. Consequently, the importance of correlations identified in many of the 'big data' sets from large human population cohort studies is often unclear and the mechanistic basis of particular phenotypes remains ambiguous. More integrated approaches are warranted, including animal models to verify that the epigenetic modifications occur in the functional tissues. Subsequently, manipulations and in vitro experiments are necessary to define the actual role of the modifications on gene expression and whether they are responsible for the phenotype.

While adaptations to the environment can be seen as beneficial for the individual, they carry health

¹Faculty of Biology, Technion-Israel Institute of Technology, Haifa, Israel. ²Department of Anthropology, Durham University, Durham, UK. ³Department of Biological Sciences, University of Nottingham, Nottingham, UK. ^{Se}e-mail: philippa@ technion.ac.il

https://doi.org/10.1038/ s41574-020-0370-8

Key points

- Human reproductive function adjusts to changing environmental conditions.
- Key 'windows of susceptibility' during various stages of early development are the most sensitive to events or exposures that can impart long-term reprogramming of adult reproductive function.
- Epigenetic modifications have a role in regulating the central control of reproduction and pubertal onset and likely mediate much of the adaptive response.
- Human cohort data are useful for identifying methylation in proxy tissues that correlates with phenotypic variation, but determining cause and effect is challenging because hormones affect the epigenome and epigenetic ageing.
- Understanding which of the modifications are functional and responsible for the phenotype requires integrating the study of human tissues, animal and cell models and molecular approaches.
- Characterization and elucidation of these adaptive mechanisms are needed to inform the clinician of alternative reproductive strategies, and the implications for fertility treatment and healthy ageing.

consequences that are often far-reaching. The timing of puberty, circulating hormone levels and reproductive lifespan all affect cancer predisposition. Moreover, age at menopause is not only consequential for women who postpone pregnancy until later life, but is also associated with the onset of osteoporosis and age-related mortality¹. Furthermore, in the clinic, diagnostic standards are typically derived from data from women in industrial northern and/or western countries, where levels of circulating reproductive hormones are characteristically higher than in women living in other settings². Increasing numbers of women are migrating around the globe and seeking medical care from doctors who are often only familiar with normative standards from the local population. It is therefore imperative to characterize these adaptive responses and elucidate the mechanisms responsible so that the clinicians can make more informed decisions. Clarification of some of these mechanisms might also open the way for developing novel clinical approaches to adjust the reproductive phenotype by targeting the epigenome.

In this Review, we address the enigma of how adult reproductive function can be shaped by childhood events. We also examine the evidence for the epigenetic regulation of key regulatory genes that govern the central control of reproduction and thereby emerge as pivotal elements in the adaptive response. We discuss this conceptual approach in understanding how variation in mammalian reproduction is regulated epigenetically and emphasize the need for multifaceted approaches to elucidate this intriguing aspect of human biology.

Plasticity of human reproduction

Reproductive phenotypes adapt to the environment. The human reproductive phenotype seems to be well programmed, with sexual maturation and menopause typically occurring within predictable age ranges in a given population^{35,36}. The constraints on the timing of these events remain largely a mystery; however, the central control of reproduction involves a complex interplay between numerous physiological systems that, when challenged, reveals considerable plasticity and adaptation to environmental conditions.

Changes in reproductive function comprise both rapid responses to immediate challenges (such as physiological,

metabolic or psychological stress) and long-term adaptation to the environment in order to optimize individual survival and reproduction under diverse conditions^{1,37}. This plasticity ensures that, during times of abundance, investment can be made in multiple physiological systems including growth, maintenance and reproduction. However, in the face of harsh conditions and deprivation (for example, infection or nutritional deficit), fewer resources can be allocated to reproduction, which might even be shut down^{38,39}. Life history theory describes and rationalizes such trade-offs in varying environmental conditions, where the costs of immediate and even future reproductive activity are assessed against the need to invest in individual maintenance and survival^{40–42} (FIG. 1).

In accordance with the prevailing environmental conditions, age at normal pubertal onset varies across populations, and between 1890-1990 advanced by as much as 3 years in industrialized countries43. Many of these changes are associated with nutritional status, improved health and increased growth rates, although some studies have highlighted differences between distinct ethnic groups⁴⁴⁻⁵³. However, the role of the environment, as distinct from genetics, was shown in a series of studies in men and women from Bangladesh, some of whom migrated to the UK. In these studies, age at puberty was later in children who had grown up in Bangladesh than in those who had migrated to the UK as young children or were second-generation migrants; the latter two groups entered puberty at a similar age to their European-ethnic neighbours7,54,55. Other studies have also reported shifts in age of pubertal onset in migrant populations, some of which have been attributed to 'catch-up growth', although the advancement of puberty following migration is apparent also in children who do not come from deprived backgrounds^{6,45,56}.

Adult reproductive function also varies between individuals who grow up in different environments (TABLE 1). Lower average reproductive hormone levels are consistently reported in populations who live in more energetically challenging environments^{57–64}. In people with Bangladeshi heritage who were born in the UK or migrated there as young children, progesterone levels in women and testosterone levels in men are markedly higher than those of individuals who grew up in Bangladesh, and are similar to those of UK-born ethnic Europeans^{6,7}. Despite progesterone levels that would be considered insufficient in western clinics, individuals in non-industrialized societies are fertile, suggesting distinct programming to allow reproductive function within these lower hormonal ranges^{2,60,65}.

Compared with women who grow up in developed countries, women who grow up in less developed countries characteristically experience menopause at a younger age, in addition to having a later puberty, and this phenotype is also dependent on the childhood environment^{5,55,66,67}. The longer reproductive lifespan and elevated hormone levels seen in children from Bangladesh who migrated to the UK were not observed in women who migrated as adults, even after spending a considerable number of years in the UK, indicating that the childhood environment is the main determinant of this adult phenotype^{5,6}.

Box 1 | Determinants of the regulatory epigenetic landscape

The nucleotide sequence of DNA

These sequences affect the mechanical properties of DNA, thus influencing nucleosome positioning, mobility and stability. The CpG content at stretches of regulatory DNA determines its potential regulation by DNA methylation and hydroxymethylation. DNA methylation recruits repressive protein complexes and so is usually inhibitory when occurring at gene promoters and enhancers, but likely has different roles in gene bodies. Hydroxylation of methylated cytosines can lead to active or passive demethylation and so facilitates transcription^{177,219}.

Nucleosome packaging of the DNA inhibits accessibility to regulatory proteins For transcription to occur, nucleosomes must usually be destabilized (for example, through incorporation of histone variants and covalent modification). This destabilization also facilitates nucleosome movement or eviction by ATP-dependent chromatin remodelers^{180,220}.

Histone variants alter various characteristics of the nucleosome

H2A.Z and H3.3 are histone variants commonly found at transcriptional start sites of actively transcribed genes. H2A.Z incorporation increases nucleosome mobility and decreases stability. The role of H3.3 in transcription is less clear, but it was proposed to enhance accessibility of the chromatin to transcription factors^{15,25,221,222}.

Multiple histone modifications have diverse roles

Covalent histone modifications can signal recruitment of regulatory proteins while some modifications alter the histone charge, possibly affecting interaction with the DNA or other histones. Histone acetylation is found in broad regions of active promoters and enhancers, and is regulated by a number of histone acetyltransferases and deacetylases. Other histone modifications, like methylation, are more localized, catalysed by fewer enzymes and impart distinct effects depending on the number of modifications and the specific histone residue targeted²²³.

Functional enhancer RNAs

Transcriptional enhancers are often transcribed into non-coding RNA (eRNA), whose functions are beginning to emerge but could vary in different contexts. Some eRNAs have been shown to regulate the proximal promoter chromatin landscape profoundly and have a role in enhancer–promoter DNA looping^{26,181}.

Higher-order chromatin

Chromatin 3D organization creates domains that both limit and mediate regulatory interactions. These domains change through development and determine long-range transcriptional regulation²²⁴.

Varying responses to early-life adversity. Although changes to the early-life environment can induce adaptive responses in pubertal timing and adult reproductive function, the actual consequences of exposure to adverse events can be puzzlingly diverse^{4,8,13}. It should be noted, however, that most scientific studies are carried out in western, educated, industrialized, rich and democratic populations, in which lifestyles and nutrition are far removed from those of our ancestral environments as hunter-gatherers and from foraging societies still in existence^{4,68}. In fact, differing responses are seen in populations with distinct cultures. For example, in developed countries, girls who experience paternal absence during childhood are widely reported to have an earlier puberty relative to their peers, while in less developed countries girls exposed to similar events show either no change or even a delay in pubertal onset^{4,69,70}. These findings suggest that the distinct outcomes are due to differences in the physiological or metabolic states in these girls, which are determined by their environment.

Physiological responses to adversity imposed by harsh conditions are usually energetically costly, as exemplified during inflammation or infection by the proliferation of immune cells. In states of limited resources, trade-offs are required between these physiological systems as described in life history theory^{12,71,72}. In fact, chronic

inflammation during childhood is often associated with pubertal delay^{73,74}, while an increased level of body fat in Amazonian forager children was seen to endow them with protection from the growth-inhibiting effects of acute inflammation⁷². Thus, the specific outcome of early-life adversity on reproductive function almost certainly varies according to the availability and allocation of resources (FIG. 1).

The hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis has a key role in allocation of metabolic resources through the centralized 'stress response', which affects reproduction as well as growth and homeostasis. Increased stress and elevated cortisol levels are usually associated with reduced reproductive function and delayed puberty75-77; however, the stress response also seems to mediate the effects of poor nutrition on the timing of pubertal onset, as seen in stressed rats fed a western diet (high levels of refined sugars and saturated fats, and low fibre content) in which normal pubertal timing was restored following environmental enrichment¹¹. Moreover, the set point of the HPA axis can be changed following early-life trauma, resulting in chronically altered circulating cortisol levels, while stress responses are attenuated in some metabolic states, such as conditions of low visceral adipose tissue78-81. It is clear, therefore, that understanding the mechanisms behind adaptive reproductive strategies needs to take into account the complexities of the wide-ranging physiological context.

Population studies, big data and finding the role of epigenetic programming. One of the ways to overcome the difficulties faced in analysing data with large variation is by looking at extensive cohort studies of human populations. This approach has revealed altered reproductive phenotypes that correlate with stressful conditions among diverse populations⁸²⁻⁸⁷. Many of these databanks maintain records of circulating hormone levels, which can inform about reproductive competence and the state of the ovarian reserve, and some also have blood or buccal DNA methylation data that might relate to the phenotypic variation. Such connections, however, are problematic given that methylation patterns differ across tissues^{88,89}, providing an ambiguous link between any changes observed. The proxy tissues assessed in these databanks do not express most of the key factors that regulate reproductive function, or the epigenetic modifications present in the functional tissues. Therefore, understanding the underlying mechanisms behind these observations remains challenging, both owing to inaccessibility of relevant tissues and also because cause and effect are very difficult to discern from longitudinal datasets.

Epigenetic modifications have been proposed to underlie altered adult phenotypes in response to earlylife events, as described in the context of Developmental Origins of Health and Disease (DOHaD)^{90,91} (BOX 2). However, evidence for such modifications in the context of the central control of reproduction remains mostly indirect, which is in contrast with the metabolic and stress axes for which human and animal studies have demonstrated a role for epigenetic modifications in adaptive responses to external signals^{10,92,93}. Glucocorticoids have a central role in the modified stress

Box 2 | Glossary of terms

5mC and 5hmC: 5-methylcytosine or 5-hydroxymethylcytosine modifications of the DNA.

Adrenarche: postnatal maturation of the adrenal gland, which occurs almost uniquely in humans at age 5–8 years and results in activation of 17,20-lyase activity and decreased 3β -hydroxysteroid dehydrogenase activity in the zona reticularis, greatly increasing circulating levels of DHEA and DHEAS.

Catch-up growth: a period of rapid growth that often occurs in children after their removal from growth-inhibiting conditions, allowing attainment of the expected final height.

Chromatin: packaging of the DNA around the histone proteins, the nature of which determines DNA accessibility.

CpG : a cytosine nucleotide followed by a guanine nucleotide, in the 5' to 3' direction.

CPP: central precocious puberty, when secondary sexual features appear before 8 years of age owing to early activation of the HPG axis and elevated circulating gonadotropin levels.

DHEA and DHEAS: dehydroepiandrosterone and dehydroepiandrosterone sulfate, 'weak' androgens (i.e. they bind the androgen receptor with low affinity) produced in humans largely by the adrenal glands following adrenarche.

DOHaD: developmental origins of health and disease.

FSH: follicle-stimulating hormone, the pituitary hormone that stimulates follicle growth in females and conversion of weak androgens to strong androgens or oestrogens in both sexes. It is composed of a common α -subunit (encoded by CGA) and a hormone-specific β -subunit (encoded by FSHB).

GnRH: gonadotropin-releasing hormone, the hypothalamic hormone that stimulates the pituitary to produce and release the gonadotropins LH and FSH.

Gonadotrope: the pituitary cell that synthesizes and secretes the gonadotropins LH and FSH.

Gonadotropins: the pituitary hormones LH and FSH.

HATs and HDACs: families of enzymes acting as histone acetyl transferases (HATs) or histone deacetylases (HDACs).

HPA axis: hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal endocrine axis that regulates adrenal function, homeostasis and the stress response.

HPG axis: hypothalamic–pituitary–gonadal endocrine axis that regulates reproductive function.

KMT and **KDM**: families of enzymes acting as lysine methyltransferases (KMTs) or lysine demethylases (KDMs).

LH: luteinizing hormone, the pituitary hormone that stimulates ovulation and corpus luteum formation and progesterone synthesis in females, and androgen synthesis in both sexes. It is composed of a common α -subunit (encoded by CGA) and a hormone-specific β -subunit (encoded by LHB).

Menarche: the first cycle of menstrual bleeding in girls

NAD */**NADH**: Nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide (NAD) and its reduced form (NADH) are involved in electron transfer in cell metabolism. They also act as cofactors for many enzymes, including the sirtuin histone deacetylases.

PRC: polycomb repressive complex, which shuts down gene expression primarily through catalysing repressive histone methylation.

Puberty: the process of sexual maturation during which the HPG axis is activated, the gonads start to produce sex-specific steroids in large amounts and the potential for sexual reproduction is attained.

RNAPII: RNA polymerase II, which transcribes most protein-coding genes.

TET enzymes: Ten-eleven translocation enzymes that catalyse the conversion of 5mC to 5hmC, as well as other less common modifications (5-formylcytosine and 5-carboxylcytosine), which can lead to demethylation.

 αKG : α -ketoglutarate (2-oxoglutarate) is produced during glucose metabolism following the deamination of glutamate and is a crucial cofactor for several chromatin-modiying enzymes, including the TET enzymes and most of the histone demethylases.

response as demonstrated by the epigenetic reprogramming of genes in the HPA axis, including the glucocorticoid receptor^{93,94}. Furthermore, glucocorticoid catabolism is decreased through reduction in the steroidogenic enzyme 5α reductase 1 in the liver, which was proposed to increase levels of active cortisol in order to enhance fuel output⁷⁹.

Preliminary work from our group shows that a *cis*-regulatory region of *SRD5A1*, the gene that encodes 5a reductase 1, is more methylated in buccal DNA of Bangladeshi women who had grown up in Bangladeshi rather than in the UK. This gene was also more methylated and its expression downregulated in a mouse model of early-life adversity that we used to study the epigenetic basis for the women's adaptive reproductive phenotype (B.B.-S. and colleagues, unpublished work). In the hypothalamus, this enzyme moderates activity of the HPA axis as well the hypothalamic–pituitary–gonadal (HPG) axis through the production of neurosteroids^{95–97}, and so seems to function as an epigenetically regulated sensor that can determine the appropriate resource allocation to each of these axes in challenging environments.

Windows of susceptibility

DOHaD and adaptive programming during fetal development. The concept of DOHaD is firmly rooted in the gestational period, having arisen from Barker's observations of differences in birthweight across England and the associated later health outcomes⁹⁸. Accordingly, most studies on the effects of early-life events on later health and disease have focused on very early stages of development, during which the patterns of gene expression that direct differentiation and organogenesis first become established. Barker and others have described fetal metabolic programming, as determined by the nutritional state during gestation, as shaping the trajectory of resource allocation and thus also health throughout later life^{92,99–101}. At least some of these effects were seen to occur independently of the uterine environment, strongly supporting an epigenetic component^{100–102}.

Maternal nutrition has been shown repeatedly to affect DNA methylation patterns in the offspring of various mammals¹⁰³. Notably, the level of methyl donors in the maternal diet at conception was seen to alter methylation levels at several metastable epialleles in the children of women from rural Gambia¹⁰⁴. In mice, maternal nutrition was noted to influence methylation in the offspring at several imprinted genes, as well as *Lep* and *Ppara* and a number of genes encoding chromatin modifiers^{9,105-108}. Changes in the epigenetic landscape, most notable at genes like these that encode factors regulating growth and metabolism, have been proposed to affect the offspring's metabolic phenotype as part of an adaptive response to the early-life adversity¹⁰⁹. This adaptive response results in altered birthweight and childhood growth rates, nutritional state and metabolic rates, all of which have key roles in pubertal timing as seen in the early pubertal onset of low-birthweight children that undergo 'catch-up' growth¹¹⁰⁻¹¹².

Poor maternal nutrition and low birthweight of female offspring are also associated with a decrease in the size of ovarian reserve, which is evident in earlier reproductive senescence in women and rats¹¹³⁻¹¹⁸. The pool of germ cells is established during gestation, and in the female reaches a finite number such that events during this time can have a marked effect on female reproductive function later in life. The effect of the uterine environment on the offspring's ovarian development is seen in neonatal rats born to nutritionally deprived mothers, which contain more activated primordial follicles and altered levels of phosphoinositide 3-kinase–Akt signalling (which regulates follicle recruitment)¹¹⁹.

Further to these data, after pubertal onset, reduced rates of ovulation and disrupted oestrous cyclicity are reported in many women who had low birthweights and those born to nutritionally deprived mothers, and this phenotype is also observed in mice¹¹⁹⁻¹²¹. The fact that infants born small for gestational age have elevated circulating FSH levels indicates that the central control of reproduction is also modified in these individuals¹²². Indeed, the neuroendocrine regulation of reproduction is being established and primed during fetal development, including the sexual dimorphic masculinization of the male brain by fetal-origin androgens, further contributing to the sensitivity of the fetal period to epigenetic perturbations¹²³.



Fig. 1 | Life history theory of environmentally induced reprogramming via the endocrine system. In response to changing environmental conditions and in the context of existing resources, resource allocation can be reprogrammed through the endocrine system to balance or shift between growth, homeostasis and reproduction, with the brain having a central role owing to its ability to regulate all three endocrine axes.

The neonatal period and 'mini-puberty'. The hypothalamus and pituitary undergo considerable postnatal maturation to establish the central mechanisms that regulate reproduction in the adult^{124–126}. Changes in epigenetic modifications during the key developmental stages thus continue to have a role in adaptive reprogramming in response to the neonatal and childhood environment, possibly via distinct mechanisms depending on the age of exposure and fluctuations in growth and metabolism that characterize these stages (FIG. 2).

During the 'mini-puberty', which occurs in the first few months of life, activity of the hypothalamicpituitary axis is stimulated owing to the immediate postnatal drop in steroid negative feedback^{125,127}. In boys and male rodents, this activity includes a very rapid and transient testosterone surge on the day of birth^{123,128-130}. The hormonal changes during this time modify hypothalamic neuron growth and development, gene expression patterns and the epigenome, and the androgen exposure leads to unique characteristics associated with brain masculinization (starting during the latter part of fetal development). Therefore, this neonatal period comprises a clearly defined window that is, at least in part, sexually dimorphic^{123,130}.

The process of hypothalamic maturation during this time is acutely sensitive to the nutritional state, particularly the kisspeptin neurons in the arcuate nucleus that regulate gonadotropin-releasing hormone (GnRH) synthesis and secretion. The development of these cells is adversely affected by poor nutrition, which is reflected in reduced neuron density, reduced *Kiss1* and *Gnrh* expression and changes in the age of pubertal onset and fertility¹³¹⁻¹³³. Moreover, the testosterone surge in these first few postnatal months was reported to correlate with growth and metabolism in early childhood^{134,135}, which likely affects pubertal timing.

The gonadotrope population of the pituitary also undergoes dynamic change in the neonatal period, with a transient wave of expansion of precursor cells that undergo proliferation and differentiation. In mice, this includes epigenetic reprogramming, some of which involves a major drop in the expression of ten–eleven translocation methylcytosine dioxygenase 1 (TET1) DNA hydroxymethylase²³. Subsequently, however, the numbers of gonadotropes are reduced to adult levels^{136,137} and the function of this temporary increase in hypothalamic–pituitary activity on later reproductive function is not clear. It is reasonable to assume, however, that this developmental phase also has a role in programming the central control of reproduction in the adult.

Sensitive windows during childhood. Early childhood is dominated by changes in growth and metabolism rather than reproductive activity, which is largely quiescent until the approach of puberty. However, numerous studies have pointed to early or mid-childhood as being a critical time for mediating the effects of adversity on reproductive function^{5–7,138–140}. One reason for sensitivity at this time is the changing levels of hormones involved in somatic growth and bone maturation, which have a role in determining the timing of pubertal onset¹⁴¹. As noted, factors that regulate metabolic function seem

Population	Location	Subsistence Strategy	Environmental Stressors	Reproductive Characteristics ^ª	Refs
Aymara	Bolivia	Agro-pastoralists	Seasonal nutritional stress and seasonally variable hard physical energy expenditure	Chronically lower levels of progesterone	60
Gainj	Papua New Guinea	Slash and burn horticulturalists	Nutritional, immunological, hard physical energy expenditure	Lower levels of reproductive steroid hormones, long menstrual cycles, lower rates of ovulation	213
Kaqchikel Maya	Guatemala	Subsistence agriculturalists	Nutritional, immunological, hard physical energy expenditure, psychological stress	Changes in luteal progesterone levels in relation to stress measured through cortisol levels	214
Lese	Democratic Republic of Congo	Slash and burn horticulturalists	Nutritional, immunological, hard physical energy expenditure	Later puberty, chronically and seasonally lower levels of reproductive steroid hormones, fewer days menstrual bleeding, lower rates of ovulation	58,215
Migrant Bangladeshis	Sylhet, Bangladesh, and London, UK	Developing country and industrialized nation	Immunological challenges during childhood	Shorter reproductive lifespan, chronically lower levels of progesterone and lower rates of ovulation in women who grow up in Bangladesh	5,6,55
Polish	Poland	Rural farmers (non-mechanized)	Seasonally variable hard physical energy expenditure	Seasonally lower levels of progesterone	216
Tamang	Nepal	Agro-pastoralists	Seasonally variable hard physical energy expenditure	Chronically and seasonally lower levels of reproductive steroid hormones	217

Table 1 | Populations in energetically demanding environments demonstrating plasticity in female reproductive characteristics

^aReproductive characteristics compared with normative clinical standards.

particularly sensitive to epigenetic modification, and changes in childhood growth rates or metabolic status certainly influence the timing of pubertal onset^{124,142}. Levels of body fat also vary considerably during this time, especially in girls¹⁴³, which affects the trade-offs between homeostasis, growth and reproduction that occur in adverse conditions (FIG. 1). Differences in the size and quality of these metabolic reserves might also explain some of the diverse responses in distinct populations.

At around 5-8 years of age, children undergo adrenarche, signalling maturation of the HPA axis and a dramatic increase in circulating levels of dehydroepiandrosterone (DHEA) and DHEA-sulfate (DHEAS). These 'weak' androgens (that is, they bind the androgen receptor with low affinity) can be converted to stronger androgens or oestradiol in specific tissues, including the brain, gonads, liver and adipose tissue¹⁴⁴, which enables them to bind the steroid receptors and presumably trigger epigenetic modifications. DHEA and DHEAS exert a multitude of actions, including modifying neurotransmitter receptors in the central nervous system, modifying the stress and immune responses and affecting bone density and metabolism¹⁴⁴, any of which might affect pubertal timing and/or the central regulation of reproduction. In adults, they also act on the ovary directly, increasing circulating anti-Müllerian hormone levels as well as the ovarian response to stimulation, suggesting their role in ovarian follicle recruitment^{145,146}. The broad effects of these androgens, including their direct effects on the HPG axis, corroborate the likelihood that early-to-mid-childhood comprises a major developmental milestone in reproductive programming. This observation is supported by studies in populations that have migrated from Bangladesh, in which 8 years of age was found to be a critical 'cut-off' age in girls and boys that influenced the adult reproductive phenotype^{5–7}.

Most studies suggest that early life is the principle phase during which adaptive reprogramming occurs. Changes in the epigenome, however, continue throughout the lifespan, both during normal developmental processes and in response to specific environmental signals, and are pivotal in the onset of puberty. The epigenome then continues to mediate the central control of reproductive function, sustaining the reproductive trajectory established by the early-life programming, while also endowing some responsiveness to changes in the immediate environment of the adult.

Central control of reproduction

Genetics reveals epigenetically regulated genes involved in pubertal timing. The timing of pubertal onset is clearly affected by the environment, but genetics also comprises a major determinant, with common and rare genetic variants having a role in the normal disparity seen in homogeneous populations¹⁴⁷. Unsurprisingly, many of these genetic variants are in key components of the HPG axis, such as genes encoding kisspeptin, GnRH, LH and FSH and their receptors¹⁴⁸. Identification of genetic mutations associated with pubertal timing in the clinic has led to the discovery of novel epigenetically regulated decisive factors, such as Makorin ring finger 3 (MKRN3), which represses the onset of puberty¹⁴⁹⁻¹⁵². MKRN3 is an E3 ubiquitin ligase and, although its function in sexual maturation is not yet known, it is expressed highly in the arcuate nucleus before puberty, drops markedly with pubertal onset, and remains thereafter at low levels. Moreover this gene is imprinted and normally expressed only from the paternal allele owing to methylation-mediated repression of the maternal allele¹⁵³. Similar studies revealed mutations in Delta-like 1 homologue (DLK1) to be strongly associated with precocious puberty as well. DLK1 is also a paternal allele-expressed imprinted gene whose expression levels in the hypothalamus fall at puberty¹⁵⁴. The fact that both genes are programmed primarily via DNA methylation, and expressed from just one allele, renders them particularly susceptible to perturbation of epigenetic states with consequences on pubertal timing. Moreover DLK1, which is also known as preadipocyte factor 1, represses adipogenesis and is





highly likely to be regulated by changes in the metabolic state, providing a novel mechanistic link between metabolism and reproduction¹⁵⁵.

Genome-wide association studies have identified several factors associated with age at menarche, which might comprise novel epigenetically regulated targets to mediate adaptive responses, especially given that many of them regulate bodyweight or metabolism¹⁵⁶⁻¹⁶⁰. One example, *CRTC1* (which encodes CRTC1 or transducer of regulated CAMP response element-binding protein 1 (TORC1)), has been linked to age at menarche¹⁶⁰ and mediates the effects not only of nutritional status on metabolic programmes, but also controls reproduction directly through activating *Kiss1* and the genes that encode both subunits of FSH¹⁶¹⁻¹⁶⁴. It is not yet clear to what degree CRTC1 activity is determined by epigenetic regulation, although it is apparently regulated by the deacetylase sirtuin 1 (REF.¹⁶⁵).

Reproductive neuroendocrinology, epigenetics and connections with metabolism. The links between metabolic state, pubertal onset and reproductive function are well recognized^{27,28,142,159,166}. Furthermore, changes in metabolite levels can directly alter the epigenome owing to their role as cofactors for several key chromatin-modifying enzymes¹⁶⁷⁻¹⁶⁹; however, not much is known about how these two fields meet in the context of the neuroendocrine control of reproduction.

Pubertal onset hinges on a number of central neuroendocrine pathways that lead to reduced inhibition and increased activation of GnRH secretion, with pivotal stimulation by kisspeptin^{159,170-172}. Increased *Kiss1* promoter activity is mediated by a reduction in polycomb repressive complex (PRC) proteins CBX7 and EED, as well as GATAD1, which recruits KDM1A, a demethylase that removes activating histone H3 K4 trimethylation^{16,173}. Subsequently, two activating lysine methyltransferase complexes, KMT2A (MLL1; which catalyses H3 K4 trimethylation at the *KISS1* promoter) and KMT2C (MLL3; which binds a distal *KISS1* enhancer), are associated with expression of the gene¹⁷ (FIG. 3).

It is not yet known whether these neuroendocrine processes respond to external signals to mediate changes in the timing of puberty, other than for a mechanism that was suggested to involve sirtuin enzymes, whose deacetylase activity is regulated by the metabolic state¹⁸. Prior to pubertal onset, the nutrient-sensitive histone deacetylase, sirtuin 1, represses Kiss1 expression through interaction with the PRC complex¹⁸. Sirtuins require NAD⁺ as an essential cofactor and, in cases of nutritional excess, NAD+ is utilized heavily, which might restrict sirtuin activity and reduce this repression¹⁶⁷⁻¹⁶⁹. Therefore, in conditions of prepubertal overnutrition, the weakening of PRC-mediated inhibition that occurs towards puberty could be further facilitated by a drop in sirtuin 1 activity, leading to precocious puberty. Conversely, undernutrition might have the opposite effect, delaying puberty owing to enhanced sirtuin 1-mediated repression of KISS1 (REF.18).

Owing to their utilization of α -ketoglutarate (α KG) as a cofactor, the DNA hydroxymethylase and/or demethylase



Fig. 3 | **Sites of epigenetic regulation reported in the central control of reproduction.** Expression of the hypothalamic *KISS1* and *GNRH* is inhibited in their respective neurons by factors shown in red. Activation of these genes involves removal of these repressors, and implementation of the activating epigenetic marks shown in green (most of the enzymes specifically responsible have yet to be identified). Similarly, in the pituitary gonadotropes, a number of inhibitory factors (in red) have been identified that repress expression of *CGA*, *LHB* and *FSHB* and, after their removal, activating marks (in green) are associated with gene expression. Data are taken from mouse models (referenced in the main text). ARC, arcuate nucleus; AVPV, anteroventral periventricular nucleus; NDR, nucleosome depleted region.

TET enzymes are also sensitive to the metabolic state, and changes in aKG availability have been seen to regulate levels of DNA methylation and hydroxymethylation^{174,175}. Increased GnRH expression during neuronal maturation in rhesus monkeys correlates with decreased DNA methylation at its promoter, suggesting relief of epigenetic-mediated repression¹⁹. Furthermore, TET2 levels in the preoptic area increase through development in mice and this appears to facilitate GnRH expression. Although *Tet2* knockout did not affect pubertal onset, it resulted in reduced levels of circulating LH and reduced fecundity in males, suggesting a role in maintenance of GnRH neuronal function²⁰. It is feasible that the nutritional state might therefore also affect GnRH levels through moderating TET2 activity on the *Gnrh* promoter.

The pituitary gonadotropes respond to the metabolic state through direct sensing of an altered glycaemic environment and resulting changes in glycolysis²⁴. Ambient hyperglycaemic conditions lead to a major metabolic imbalance in these cells, including elevated levels of aKG and a drop in the NAD+ to NADH ratio, which affect TET and sirtuin enzyme activity. Consequently, the gonadotrope epigenome undergoes a decrease in 5-methylcytosine and an increase in 5-hvdroxymethylcytosine DNA methylation, with elevated levels of histone acetylation²⁴. The primary effect of these changes is a reduction in Fshb expression and circulating levels of FSH, which would be expected to affect female fertility²⁴. In accordance with these findings in mice, young girls with type 2 diabetes mellitus have steroid profiles that reflect low FSH levels and, worryingly, their menstrual dysfunction is reported not to improve following extensive anti-hyperglycaemic treatment¹⁷⁶. This outcome is highly suggestive of an epigenetic basis to their poor reproductive function, with implications for administering the most appropriate treatments.

Importance of the chromatin landscape. The functionality of an epigenetic modification can only be understood if studied in the relevant chromatin context. The mode of regulating a particular gene's expression is determined by the chromatin organization at its proximal promoter and often numerous distal transcriptional enhancers, which define how the gene can be activated or repressed. This chromatin landscape comprises the DNA and the packaging histone proteins and how these are organized and modified (BOX 1). The DNA sequence determines potential regulation by DNA methylation and hydroxymethylation and also influences nucleosome positioning and the way in which the DNA is packaged into nucleosomes¹⁷⁷. The nucleosome packaging varies also owing to the inclusion of histone variants and covalent histone modifications, both of which can alter the DNA-histone interactions as well as the stability and mobility of the nucleosomes^{25,178-180}. This organization is instrumental in determining the mechanisms that are involved in regulating gene transcription and expression levels and how they might be perturbed, and its study is thus essential to appreciate the possible function of any differential epigenetic modifications detected in large population screens^{25,178,181,182}.

The gonadotropin LH α -subunit and β -subunitencoding genes provide an example of how very different chromatin packaging explains not only their distinct expression levels and unique methods of regulation, but also their respective propensities to epigenetic regulation^{15,25,183}. Transcription of *Cga*, which encodes the common gonadotropin α -subunit, is initiated quite easily owing to the activity of a cell-specific distal enhancer that directs open chromatin at the proximal promoter, leaving it free from nucleosomes in gonadotrope cells^{25,26}. This chromatin organization allows unobstructed access of the regulatory transcription factors and general transcription machinery to the transcriptional start site of the gene. The major barrier for upregulating transcription is therefore traversing the first (+1) nucleosome, which is downstream of the transcriptional start site, and transcription is stimulated through targeting this nucleosome²⁵. The +1 nucleosome is made less stable by incorporation of the histone variant H2A.Z, and this reduced stability helps RNAPII passage through the nucleosome, which increases rates of transcription²⁵. The transcriptional upregulation of *Cga* by GnRH also involves induction of several activating histone modifications, including H3 phosphorylation and acetylation, which reduce the histone tail–DNA interaction, probably also contributing to the transcription efficiency^{14,25,181} (FIG. 3).

The potential regulation by DNA methylation of these genes is also distinct. In contrast to *Cga*, which virtually lacks CpG sites on its proximal promoter, *Lhb* is tightly regulated by DNA methylation and the TET enzymes²³. In gonadotrope precursor cells, expression of *Lhb* is repressed by TET1 through non-catalytic mechanisms. However, TET1 expression is downregulated during development and, in fully differentiated gonadotrope cells, its place on the *Lhb* gene promoter is replaced by TET2, which catalyses the activating hydroxymethylation at this locus²³ (FIG. 3).

Also in marked contrast to *Cga*, the *Lhb* promoter is packaged in a nucleosome, which covers the binding sites for the crucial *Lhb* activating transcription factors SF1, PITX1 and EGR1 (REFS^{15,25}). Expression of *Lhb* thus requires remodelling of the promoter chromatin to allow transcription initiation. This remodelling involves incorporation of H2A.Z into the promoter nucleosome, which increases its mobility on the DNA and facilitates transcription factor binding¹⁵. This nucleosome is also covalently modified following gonadotrope exposure to GnRH, which increases recruitment of menin, a key component of the KMT2A and/or KMT2B methyltransferase complex that is responsible for the activating H3 K4 trimethylation modification at the gene promoter²¹ (FIG. 3).

The chromatin landscape of Fshb has yet to be determined in such detail, but earlier studies reported that this gene is repressed in partially differentiated gonadotrope cell lines by class I and class II histone deacetylases (HDACs) whose actions are overcome by GnRH^{22,184-186}. This repressive role for HDACs has been confirmed more reccently in primary gonadotrope cells from sexually immature mice, in which GnRH was seen to increase levels of histone acetylation at the Fshb gene promoter (L.P. and P.M., unpublished work). The repressive actions of HDACs on this gene and the ability of GnRH to overcome their activity probably comprise a key repressive mechanism that is lifted at the time of puberty when GnRH levels increase (FIG. 3). Further studies are required to understand the role of these and other epigenetic-driven mechanisms that mediate adaptive changes in reproductive function in response to the environment.

Identifying the epigenetic drivers

Reproduction, epigenetics and ageing: cause and effect. One of the shortcomings of trying to understand phenotypic variation by looking at human cohort methylome



Fig. 4 | Integrating experimental approaches to understand the role of the epigenome in adaptive reproductive strategies in humans. (Step 1) Association of methylation data with reproductive phenotypic variation in human cohort studies can be combined with (Step 2) animal models to verify modification in the functional tissue. (Step 3) Cell models can then be used to characterize the chromatin at this genomic region and determine the genes that are affected. (Step 4) Subsequently, in vitro studies, preferably at the single-molecule level, can reveal the actual function of the epigenetic modification in terms of structural characteristics of the nucleosome, transcription factor binding and progression of the polymerase along the DNA. Understanding phenotypic variation in reproductive function and how this is determined by early-life experiences through changes in the epigenome will inform the clinician and could lead to novel approaches for intervention of reproductive function and associated health benefits.

data is being able to decipher cause from effect¹⁸⁷. Methylome analyses have been performed in girls and boys across puberty using peripheral leukocytes or blood mononuclear cells, and in one study a causal relationship between the changes in DNA methylation and secondary sexual characteristics was inferred¹⁸⁸. However, gonadal steroids are known to modify the epigenome²⁹⁻³¹, and two such studies reported particular enrichment for differential methylation at regions close to oestrogen receptor binding sites or E2-responsive genes, which suggests that the altered methylation might be mediated by the increase in steroids^{189,190}. As noted by these authors, it is not possible to determine from these observations whether the epigenetic changes are the result or the cause of the hormonal changes. Bessa and colleagues¹⁹⁰ also examined changes in CpG methylation in individuals with central precocious puberty and identified 48 hypermethylated ZNF protein-encoding genes, which they acknowledged might contribute to central precocious puberty but equally might result from functional changes in the genetic network underlying this condition.

Global levels of DNA methylation normally change over the lifespan, known as epigenetic drift or ageing^{191,192}, and this too is affected by activity of the reproductive axis. Some CpG sites show more variation over time than others, and when taken together they reflect quite precisely the ageing process. This observation has led to the development of predictive tools of chronological age, termed epigenetic clocks^{193,194}. The tickrates of such epigenetic clocks are affected by various factors including environmental influences, and they correlate remarkably well with general health^{193,195-198}. Importantly, the pace of epigenetic ageing is altered following puberty and menopause, and in certain tissues specifically in response to oestradiol^{32-34,199,200}. Thus, early-life environmental exposures or events that alter reproductive trajectories, including age at puberty or

circulating hormone levels, would likely affect epigenetic ageing. So here too, differences observed in the methylome might reflect the altered reproductive function but are not necessarily responsible for the individual's phenotype. Deciphering how these changes in DNA methylation profiles relate to environmentally modified reproductive strategies and the molecular mechanisms involved requires additional experimental approaches, first to address whether the modification is in fact altered in the functional tissue and cell type that determines the reproductive phenotype, and second to demonstrate its role (FIG. 4).

Animal models, tissue accessibility and functional *adaptive strategies.* DNA methylation patterns vary between tissues, and in easily attainable proxy tissues are not necessarily the same as in the relevant functional tissues^{88,201,202}. Animal models can therefore be valuable for dissection of the relevant tissue, further facilitated by expression of fluorescent markers that enable isolation of specific cell populations. Enrichment of specific cell types is especially important for epigenetic profiling in heterogeneous tissues such as the pituitary^{23,203}, where the gonadotrope cells make up only a small percentage (3–10%) of the gland¹³⁷. Without such isolation of the particular cell type, erroneous assumptions about differential epigenetic modifications can be made following changes in the relative population sizes rather than epigenetic changes per se in the cells of interest.

Animal models also present some of the complexities of the physiological and metabolic backgrounds that might mediate the adaptive response. Their energetic state can be manipulated, to some degree, to mimic specific human environments, although the parallels here are clearly limited, and new animal models that more accurately represent human biology are needed. Among rodents, the spiny mouse (*Acomys cahirinus*) is unique in experiencing human-like menstruation, and also postnatal maturation of the adrenal zona reticularis, mimicking changes in circulating adrenal androgen levels that occur during adrenarche^{204,205}. Such characteristics suggest that this species might be more suitable for the study of reproductive and adrenal function than commonly used rodent models. Mouse lemurs (*Microcebus* spp.) have also been heralded recently as a particularly suitable new model for studying human physiology and disease^{206,207}; they share the advantages of mice, owing to their small size, breeding rates and capacities, but, as primates, are genetically closer to humans.

Adopting new research models presents many technical drawbacks and hurdles and ethical opposition, especially for primate research²⁰⁷. However, the information that appropriate animal models can contribute to identifying the mechanisms responsible for adaptive responses is invaluable, as evident in our preliminary work on the Bangladeshi migrant populations in which we integrated findings from methylation analysis of human buccal DNA and a mouse model of early-life stress to mimic challenges of the Bangladeshi environment. In this way we were able to identify altered epigenetic signatures of several genes that regulate ovarian follicle recruitment and appear to explain the depleted ovarian reserve in the women who spent their childhoods in Bangladesh (B.B.-S. and colleagues, unpublished work).

Determining a function for the epigenetic modification.

Given the constant dialogue between the epigenome and reproductive axis, it is important that we verify whether a particular modification that is differentially associated with a phenotype has a functional consequence. Discerning the importance of differential modifications at a specific genomic locus is usually challenging unless found at known gene regulatory enhancers or promoters, which is highly indicative of function. Understanding the role of a modification on the expression of a particular gene requires knowledge of the chromatin landscape governing its transcription. High-precision mapping of the nucleosome positions, identification of the regulatory proteins that bind this genomic region and how this binding is altered by the modifications, as well as an understanding of the higher order chromatin structure and the role of long non-coding RNAs, all need to be considered (BOX 1). An overview of these techniques is beyond the scope of this Review, but it should be emphasized that chromatin organization at gene regulatory regions can vary considerably between expressing and non-expressing cells, as at the Cga proximal promoter, which is devoid of a nucleosome only in gonadotropes²⁵. This type of analysis must therefore be performed in an appropriate cell type that normally expresses the gene of study.

Once the chromatin landscape is known, its manipulation, (for example, using CRISPR–Cas9-based targeting approaches) can be used to establish functionality in cultured cells, and potentially also in animal models^{208–210}. For greater precision, single-molecule approaches in vitro can reveal exactly how epigenetic modifications affect the interactions of packaging and regulatory proteins with a specific DNA sequence. After reconstituting

nucleosomes on the regulatory DNA to recapitulate the native chromatin landscape, the DNA can be 'unzipped' using an optical trap to reveal both the force of interaction on a piconewton scale, and the protein position on the DNA at nearly base-pair resolution^{178,211} (FIG. 4). In this way, we have deciphered the function of H2A.Z at the gonadotropin genes²⁵ and revealed how a transcription factor binds chromatin-packaged DNA at the proximal promoter of $Lhb^{15,212}$. This approach has the further potential to assess how epigenetic modifications affect RNAPII progression along the DNA, the effects of DNA and histone modifications, as well as additional histone variants on nucleosome stability and mobility, and how these processes regulate the recruitment and effects of regulatory DNA-binding transcription factors. Clarification of the impact of epigenetic modifications that participate in adaptive reproductive strategies at this level of resolution is essential to complete our understanding of reproductive plasticity and could facilitate the development of targeted approaches for modifying reproductive function.

Conclusions

The field of biological regulation is at one of its most exciting times. Human reproductive phenotypes are shaped by the environment, and adult reproductive function can be reprogrammed following events during key developmental stages of early life, as discussed here. Moreover, there is an expanding list of ways in which the chromatin can be modified through newly discovered epigenetic modifications and regulatory non-coding RNAs that alter chromatin structure, providing seemingly endless mechanisms through which physiological function might be modified in response to external cues. Challenges ahead include integrating the roles of these potential regulators into our understanding of how the reproductive endocrine system operates normally and in adaptive responses to changes in the environment.

In a wider perspective, the environment in the developed world has changed dramatically since the industrial revolution, and is continuing to do so as technological advances fundamentally alter our lifestyles. Changes in quantity and quality of our nutrition, pathogen exposure, levels of physical activity and stress surely affect our physiology directly, but might also provoke such adaptive responses in reproductive function, with important implications for human health. Beyond determining the start and end of the reproductive lifespan and rates of fertility, consequences extend to the broad impact of hormonal exposure and epigenetic ageing on health and senescence more generally. Understanding these complex aspects of human health is thus crucial and will require extensive, multipronged approaches, as highlighted in this review. On the positive side, epigenetic modifications can potentially be targeted, and so elucidating the mechanistic basis of these adaptive processes at a molecular level could open the way for developing tools to modify a variety of reproductive phenotypes.

Published online: 03 July 2020

- Jasienska, G., Bribiescas, R. G., Furberg, A.-S., Helle, S. & Nüñez-de la Mora, A. Human reproduction and health: an evolutionary perspective. *Lancet* **390**, 510–520 (2017).
- Vitzthum, V. J. The ecology and evolutionary endocrinology of reproduction in the human female. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* **140**, 95–136 (2009).
 Jaenisch, R. & Bird, A. Epigenetic regulation of gene
- Jaenisch, R. & Bird, A. Epigenetic regulation of gene expression: how the genome integrates intrinsic and environmental signals. *Nat. Genet.* 33, 245–254 (2003).
- Sear, R., Sheppard, P. & Coall, D. A. Cross-cultural evidence does not support universal acceleration of puberty in father-absent households. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* 374, 20180124 (2019).
- Begum, K. et al. Ethnicity or environment: effects of migration on ovarian reserve among Bangladeshi women in the United Kingdom. *Fertil. Steril.* 105, 744–754.e1 (2016).
- Núñez-De La Mora, A., Chatterton, R. T., Choudhury, O. A., Napolitano, D. A. & Bentley, G. R. Childhood conditions influence adult progesterone levels. *PLoS Med.* 4, 0813–0821 (2007).
- Magid, K., Chatterton, R. T., Ahamed, F. U. & Bentley, G. R. Childhood ecology influences salivary testosterone, pubertal age and stature of Bangladeshi UK migrant men. *Nat. Ecol. Evol.* 2, 1146–1154 (2018).
- Kuzawa, C. W. & Bragg, J. M. Plasticity in human life history strategy. *Curr. Anthropol.* 53, S369–S382 (2012).
- Safi-Stibler, S. & Gabory, A. Epigenetics and the developmental origins of health and disease: parental environment signalling to the epigenome, critical time windows and sculpting the adult phenotype. *Semin. Cell Dev. Biol.* **97**, 172–180 (2020).
- Jazwiec, P. A. & Sloboda, D. M. Nutritional adversity, sex and reproduction: 30 years of DOHaD and what have we learned? *J. Endocrinol.* 242, T51–T68 (2019).
- Strzelewicz, A. R. et al. Access to a high resource environment protects against accelerated maturation following early life stress: a translational animal model of high, medium and low security settings. *Horm. Behav.* 111, 46–59 (2019).
- Wang, A., Luan, H. H. & Medzhitov, R. An evolutionary perspective on immunometabolism. *Science* 363, eaar3932 (2019).
- Ellis, B. J. & Del Giudice, M. Developmental adaptation to stress: an evolutionary perspective. *Annu. Rev. Psychol.* **70**, 111–139 (2019).
- Haj, M. et al. Mitogen- and stress-activated protein kinase 1 is required for gonadotropin-releasing hormone-mediated activation of gonadotropin α-subunit expression. J. Biol. Chem. 292, 20720–20731 (2017).
- Rudnizky, S., Khamis, H., Malik, O., Melamed, P. & Kaplan, A. The base pair-scale diffusion of nucleosomes modulates binding of transcription factors. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **116**, 12161–12166 (2019).
- Lomniczi, A. et al. Epigenetic regulation of puberty via Zinc finger protein-mediated transcriptional repression. *Nat. Commun.* 6, 10195 (2015).
- Toro, C. A., Wright, H., Aylwin, C. F., Ojeda, S. R. & Lomniczi, A. Trithorax dependent changes in chromatin landscape at enhancer and promoter regions drive female puberty. *Nat. Commun.* 9, 57 (2018).
- Vazquez, M. J. et al. SIRT1 mediates obesity- and nutrient-dependent perturbation of pubertal timing by epigenetically controlling Kiss1 expression. *Nat. Commun.* 9, 4194 (2018).
- Kurian, J. R., Keen, K. L. & Terasawa, E. Epigenetic changes coincide with in vitro primate GnRH neuronal maturation. *Endocrinology* 151, 5359–5368 (2010).
- Kurian, J. R. et al. The methylcytosine dioxygenase ten-eleven translocase-2 (tet2) enables elevated GnRH gene expression and maintenance of male reproductive function. *Endocrinology* 157, 3588–3603 (2016).
- Wijeweera, A. et al. Gonadotropin gene transcription is activated by menin-mediated effects on the chromatin. *Biochim. Biophys. Acta* 1849, 328–341 (2015).
- Lim, S. et al. Distinct mechanisms involving diverse histone deacetylases repress expression of the two gonadotropin-subunit genes in immature gonadotropes, and their actions are overcome by gonadotropin-releasing hormone. *Mol. Cell. Biol.* 27, 4105–4120 (2007).

- Yosefzon, Y. et al. An epigenetic switch repressing Tet1 in gonadotropes activates the reproductive axis. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 114, 10131–10136 (2017).
- Feldman, A. et al. Sensitivity of pituitary gonadotropes to hyperglycemia leads to epigenetic aberrations and reduced folicle-stimulating hormone levels. *FASEB J.* 33, 1020–1032 (2019).
- Rudnizky, S. et al. H2A.Z controls the stability and mobility of nucleosomes to regulate expression of the LH genes. *Nat. Commun.* 7, 12958 (2016).
- Pnueli, L., Rudnizky, S., Yosefzon, Y. & Melamed, P. RNA transcribed from a distal enhancer is required for activating the chromatin at the promoter of the gonadotropin a-subunit gene. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci.* USA 112, 4369–4374 (2015).
- Sanchez-Garrido, M. A. et al. Intergenerational influence of paternal obesity on metabolic and reproductive health parameters of the offspring: male-preferential impact and involvement of Kiss1mediated pathways. *Endocrinology* **159**, 1005–1018 (2018).
- Roa, J. et al. Metabolic regulation of female puberty via hypothalamic AMPK–kisspeptin signaling. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 115, E10758–E10767 (2018).
- Kundakovic, M. Sex-specific epigenetics: implications for environmental studies of brain and behavior. *Curr. Environ. Health Rep.* 4, 385–391 (2017).
- McCarthy, M. M. et al. The epigenetics of sex differences in the brain. J. Neurosci. 29, 12815–12823 (2009).
- Le Dily, F. & Beato, M. Signaling by steroid hormones in the 3D nuclear space. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* 19, E306 (2018).
- Levine, M. E. et al. Menopause accelerates biological aging. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 113, 9327–9332 (2016).
- Sehl, M. E., Henry, J. E., Storniolo, A. M., Ganz, P. A. & Horvath, S. DNA methylation age is elevated in breast tissue of healthy women. *Breast Cancer Res. Treat.* 164, 209–219 (2017).
- Stubbs, T. M. et al. Multi-tissue DNA methylation age predictor in mouse. *Genome Biol.* 18, 68 (2017).
- Sun, S. S. et al. National estimates of the timing of sexual maturation and racial differences among US children. *Pediatrics* 110, 911–919 (2002).
- Gold, E. B. et al. Factors related to age at natural menopause: longitudinal analyses from SWAN. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* **178**, 70–83 (2013).
- Ellison, P. T. Developmental influences on adult ovarian hormonal function. *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* 8, 725–734 (1996).
- Lachelin, G. C. L. & Yen, S. S. C. Hypothalamic chronic anovulation. Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol. 130, 825–831 (1978).
- Ellison, P. T. Human ovarian function and reproductive ecology: new hypotheses. *Am. Anthropol.* 92, 933–952 (1990).
- Gadgil, M. & Bossert, W. H. Life historical consequences of natural selection. *Am. Nat.* 104, 1–24 (1970).
- 41. Roff, D. A. *Life History Evolution* (Sinauer Associates, 2002).
- Stearns, S. C. *The Evolution of Life Histories* (Oxford University Press, 1992).
 Parent, A.-S., Franssen, D., Fudvoye, J., Gérard, A. &
- Parent, A.-S., Franssen, D., Fudvoye, J., Gérard, A. & Bourguignon, J.-P. Developmental variations in environmental influences including endocrine disruptors on pubertal timing and neuroendocrine control: revision of human observations and mechanistic insight from rodents. *Front. Neuroendocrinol.* 38, 12–36 (2015).
- Anderson, S. E. & Must, A. Interpreting the continued decline in the average age at menarche: results from two nationally representative surveys of U.S. girls studied 10 years apart. *J. Pediatr.* 147, 753–760 (2005).
- Parent, A.-S. et al. The timing of normal puberty and the age limits of sexual precocity: variations around the world, secular trends, and changes after migration. *Endocr. Rev.* 24, 668–693 (2003).
- Herman-Giddens, M. E. et al. Secondary sexual characteristics in boys: data from the Pediatric Research in Office Settings network. *Pediatrics* 130, e1058–e1068 (2012).
- Herman-Giddens, M. É. et al. Secondary sexual characteristics and menses in young girls seen in office practice: a study from the Pediatric Research in Office Settings network. *Pediatrics* **99**, 505–512 (1997).
- Aksglaede, L., Juul, A., Olsen, L. W. & Sørensen, T. I. A. Age at puberty and the emerging obesity epidemic. *PLoS One* 4, e8450 (2009).

- Sun, Y., Mensah, F. K., Azzopardi, P., Patton, G. C. & Wake, M. Childhood social disadvantage and pubertal timing: a national birth cohort from Australia. *Pediatrics* 139, e20164099 (2017).
- Jansen, E. C., Herrán, O. F. & Villamor, E. Trends and correlates of age at menarche in Colombia: results from a nationally representative survey. *Econ. Hum. Biol.* 19, 138–144 (2015).
- Villamor, E. & Jansen, E. C. Nutritional determinants of the timing of puberty. *Annu. Rev. Public. Health* **37**, 33–46 (2016).
 Sørensen, K., Akselaede, L., Petersen, J. H. & Juul, A.
- Sørensen, K., Åksglaede, L., Petersen, J. H. & Juul, A. Recent changes in pubertal timing in healthy Danish boys: associations with body mass index. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 95, 263–270 (2010).
- Biro, F. M. et al. Onset of breast development in a longitudinal cohort. *Pediatrics* 132, 1019–1027 (2013).
- Houghton, L. C. et al. A migrant study of pubertal timing and tempo in British-Bangladeshi girls at varying risk for breast cancer. *Breast Cancer Res.* 16, 469 (2014).
- 469 (2014).
 55. Murphy, L. et al. Life course effects on age at menopause among Bangladeshi sedentees and migrants to the UK. *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* 25, 83–93 (2013).
- Proos, L. A. Growth and development of Indian children adopted in Sweden. *Indian. J. Med. Res.* 130, 646–650 (2009).
- 57. Ellison, P. T. et al. Population variation in ovarian function. *Lancet* **342**, 433–434 (1993).
- Bentley, G. R., Harrigan, A. M. & Ellison, P. T. Dietary composition and ovarian function among Lese horticulturalist women of the Ituri forest, Democratic Republic of Congo. *Eur. J. Clin. Nutr.* **52**, 261–270 (1998).
- Marsh, E. E. et al. Estrogen levels are higher across the menstrual cycle in African-American women compared with Caucasian women. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 96, 3199–3206 (2011).
- Vitzthum, V. J., Spielvogel, H. & Thornburg, J. Interpopulational differences in progesterone levels during conception and implantation in humans. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **101**, 1443–1448 (2004).
- Pinheiro, S. P., Holmes, M. D., Pollak, M. N., Barbieri, R. L. & Hankinson, S. E. Racial differences in premenopausal endogenous hormones. *Cancer Epidemiol. Biomarkers Prev.* 14, 2147–2153 (2005).
- Reutman, S. R. et al. Urinary reproductive hormone level differences between African American and Caucasian women of reproductive age. *Fertil. Steril.* 78, 383–391 (2002).
- Helfrecht, C. et al. DHEAS patterning across childhood in three sub-Saharan populations: associations with age, sex, ethnicity, and cortisol. *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* **30**, e23090 (2018).
- Ellison, P. T. & Panter-Brick, C. Salivary testosterone levels among Tamang and Kami males of central Nepal. *Hum. Biol.* 68, 955–965 (1996).
- Nuñez-De La Mora, A., Bentley, G. R., Choudhury, O. A., Napolitano, D. A. & Chatterton, R. T. The impact of developmental conditions on adult salivary estradiol levels: why this differs from progesterone? *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* 20, 2–14 (2008).
- Goodman, M. J., Estioko-Griffin, A., Griffin, P. B. & Grove, J. S. Menarche, pregnancy, birth spacing and menopause among the Agta women foragers of Cagayan province, Luzon, the Philippines. *Ann. Hum. Biol.* **12**, 169–177 (1985).
- Tserotas, K. & Blümel, J. E. Menopause research in Latin America. *Climacteric* 22, 17–21 (2019).
- Henrich, J., Heine, S. J. & Norenzayan, A. The weirdest people in the world? *Behav. Brain Sci.* 33, 61–83 (2010).
- Webster, G. D., Graber, J. A., Gesselman, A. N., Crosier, B. S. & Schember, T. O. A life history theory of father absence and menarche: a meta-analysis. *Evol. Psychol.* 12, 273–294 (2014).
- Sheppard, P., Snopkowski, K. & Sear, R. Father absence and reproduction-related outcomes in Malaysia, a transitional fertility population. *Hum. Nat.* 25, 213–234 (2014).
- 25, 213–234 (2014).
 Muehlenbein, M. P., Hirschtick, J. L., Bonner, J. Z. & Swartz, A. M. Toward quantifying the usage costs of human immunity: altered metabolic rates and hormone levels during acute immune activation in men. *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* 22, 546–556 (2010).
- Urlacher, S. S. et al. Tradeoffs between immune function and childhood growth among Amazonian forager-horticulturalists. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 115, E3914–E3921 (2018).

- DeBoer, M. D. & Denson, L. A. Delays in puberty, growth, and accrual of bone mineral density in pediatric Crohn's disease: despite temporal changes in disease severity, the need for monitoring remains. *J. Pediatr.* **163**, 17–22 (2013).
- Ballinger, A. B., Savage, M. O. & Sanderson, I. R. Delayed puberty associated with inflammatory bowel disease. *Pediatr. Res.* 53, 205–210 (2003).
- Toufexis, D., Rivarola, M. A., Lara, H. & Viau, V. Stress and the reproductive axis. *J. Neuroendocrinol.* 26, 573–586 (2014).
- Joseph, D. & Whirledge, S. Stress and the HPA axis: balancing homeostasis and fertility. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* 18, 2224 (2017).
- Acevedo-Rodriguez, A. et al. Emerging insights into hypothalamic-pituitary-gonadal axis regulation and interaction with stress signalling. *J. Neuroendocrinol.* 30, e12590 (2018).
- Yehuda, R. et al. Low urinary cortisol excretion in patients with posttraumatic stress disorder. J. Nerv. Ment. Dis. 178, 366–369 (1990).
- Yehuda, R. & Seckl, J. Minireview: stress-related psychiatric disorders with low cortisol levels: a metabolic hypothesis. *Endocrinology* **152**, 4496–4503 (2011).
- Heim, C., Newport, D. J., Mletzko, T., Miller, A. H. & Nemeroff, C. B. The link between childhood trauma and depression: insights from HPA axis studies in humans. *Psychoneuroendocrinology* 33, 693–710 (2008).
- Tilbrook, A. J. & Clarke, I. J. Neuroendocrine mechanisms of innate states of attenuated responsiveness of the hypothalamo-pituitary adrenal axis to stress. *Front. Neuroendocrinol.* 27, 285–307 (2006).
- Magnus, M. C. et al. Childhood psychosocial adversity and female reproductive timing: a cohort study of the ALSPAC mothers. J. Epidemiol. Community Health 72, 34–40 (2018).
- Sheppard, P., Pearce, M. S. & Sear, R. How does childhood socioeconomic hardship affect reproductive strategy? Pathways of development. *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* 28, 356–363 (2016).
- Demakakos, P., Pashayan, N., Chrousos, G., Linara-Demakakou, E. & Mishra, G. D. Childhood experiences of parenting and age at menarche, age at menopause and duration of reproductive lifespan: evidence from the English longitudinal study of ageing. *Maturitas* **122**, 66–72 (2019).
- Gaydosh, L., Belsky, D. W., Domingue, B. W., Boardman, J. D. & Harris, K. M. Father absence and accelerated reproductive development in non-hispanic white women in the United States. *Demography* 55, 1245–1267 (2018).
- InterLACE Study Team. Variations in reproductive events across life: a pooled analysis of data from 505,147 women across 10 countries. *Hum. Reprod.* 34, 881–893 (2019).
- Boynton-Jarrett, R. & Harville, E. W. A prospective study of childhood social hardships and age at menarche. *Ann. Epidemiol.* 22, 731–737 (2012).
- Lin, X. et al. Choice of surrogate tissue influences neonatal EWAS findings. *BMC Med.* 15, 211 (2017).
 Hannon, E., Lunnon, K., Schalkwyk, L. & Mill, J.
- Hannon, E., Lunnon, K., Schalkwyk, L. & Mill, J. Interindividual methylomic variation across blood, cortex, and cerebellum: implications for epigenetic studies of neurological and neuropsychiatric phenotypes. *Epigenetics* 10, 1024–1032 (2015).
- Gluckman, P. D. & Hanson, M. A. Living with the past: evolution, development, and patterns of disease. *Science* **305**, 1733–1736 (2004).
- Gluckman, P. D., Hanson, M. A. & Beedle, A. S. Early life events and their consequences for later disease: a life history and evolutionary perspective. *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* 19, 1–19 (2007).
- Goyal, D., Limesand, S. W. & Goyal, R. Epigenetic responses and the developmental origins of health and disease. *J. Endocrinol.* 242, T105–T119 (2019).
- Matthews, S. G. & McGowan, P. O. Developmental programming of the HPA axis and related behaviours: epigenetic mechanisms. *J. Endocrinol.* 242, T69–T79 (2019).
- McGowan, P. O. et al. Epigenetic regulation of the glucocorticoid receptor in human brain associates with childhood abuse. *Nat. Neurosci.* 12, 342–348 (2009).
- Livingstone, D. E. W. et al. Relative adrenal insufficiency in mice deficient in 5α-reductase 1. *J. Endocrinol.* 222, 257–266 (2014).
- Camille Melón, L. & Maguire, J. GABAergic regulation of the HPA and HPG axes and the impact of stress on

reproductive function. J. Steroid Biochem. Mol. Biol. 160, 196–203 (2016).

- Brunton, P. J. Programming the brain and behaviour by early-life stress: a focus on neuroactive steroids. J. Neuroendocrinol. 27, 468–480 (2015).
- Barker, D. J. The fetal and infant origins of adult disease. *BMJ* 301, 1111 (1990).
- Chadio, S. & Kotsampasi, B. The role of early life nutrition in programming of reproductive function. *J. Dev. Orig. Health Dis.* 5, 2–15 (2014).
- Fleming, T.P. et al. Origins of lifetime health around the time of conception: causes and consequences. *Lancet* 391, 1842–1852 (2018).
- Velazquez, M. A., Fleming, T. P. & Watkins, A. J. Periconceptional environment and the developmental origins of disease. *J. Endocrinol.* 242, T33–T49 (2019).
- 102. Nicholas, L. M. et al. Differential effects of maternal obesity and weight loss in the periconceptional period on the epigenetic regulation of hepatic insulinsignaling pathways in the offspring. *FASEB J.* 27, 3786–3796 (2013).
- Rando, O. J. & Simmons, R. A. I'm eating for two: parental dietary effects on offspring metabolism. *Cell* 161, 93–105 (2015).
- Dominguez-Salas, P. et al. Maternal nutrition at conception modulates DNA methylation of human metastable epialleles. *Nat. Commun.* 5, 3746 (2014).
- 105. Ge, Z. et al. DNA methylation in oocytes and liver of female mice and their offspring: effects of high-fat-dietinduced obesity. *Env. Health Perspect.* **122**, 159–164 (2014).
- 106. Lillycrop, K. et al. Induction of altered epigenetic regulation of the hepatic glucocorticoid receptor in the offspring of rats fed a protein-restricted diet during pregnancy suggests that reduced DNA methyltransferase-1 expression is involved in impaired DNA methylation and changes in histone modifications. *Br. J. Nutr.* **97**, 1064–1073 (2007)
- modifications. Br. J. Nutr. 97, 1064–1073 (2007).
 107. Gabory, A. et al. Maternal diets trigger sex-specific divergent trajectories of gene expression and epigenetic systems in mouse placenta. PLoS One 7, e47986 (2012).
- Gallou-Kabani, C. et al. Sex- and diet-specific changes of imprinted gene expression and DNA methylation in mouse placenta under a high-fat diet. *PLoS One* 5, e14398 (2010).
- Tobi, E. W. et al. DNA methylation signatures link prenatal famine exposure to growth and metabolism. *Nat. Commun.* 5, 5592 (2014).
- Wang, Y., Dinse, G. E. & Rogan, W. J. Birth weight, early weight gain and pubertal maturation: a longitudinal study. *Pediatr. Obes.* 7, 101–109 (2012).
- Ong, K. K. et al. Infancy weight gain predicts childhood body fat and age at menarche in girls. *J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab.* 94, 1527–1532 (2009).
- Clin. Endochild. Metab. **54**, 157–1552 (2009).
 Salgin, B. et al. Even transient rapid infancy weight gain is associated with higher BMI in young adults and earlier menarche. *Int. J. Obes.* **39**, 939–944 (2015).
- 113. Chernoff, N. et al. Reproductive effects of maternal and pre-weaning undernutrition in rat offspring: age at puberty, onset of female reproductive senescence and intergenerational pup growth and viability. *Reprod. Toxicol.* 28, 489–494 (2009).
- Guzmán, C. et al. Protein restriction during fetal and neonatal development in the rat alters reproductive function and accelerates reproductive ageing in female progeny. J. Physiol. 572, 97–108 (2006).
- Khorram, O., Keen-Rinehart, E., Chuang, T.-D., Ross, M. G. & Desai, M. Maternal undernutrition induces premature reproductive senescence in adult female rat offspring. *Fertil.* Steril. **103**, 291–298.e2 (2015).
- 116. Yarde, F. et al. Prenatal famine, birthweight, reproductive performance and age at menopause: the Dutch hunger winter families study. *Hum. Reprod.* 28, 3328–3336 (2013).
- 117. Bernal, A. B., Vickers, M. H., Hampton, M. B., Poynton, R. A. & Sloboda, D. M. Maternal undernutrition significantly impacts ovarian follicle number and increases ovarian oxidative stress in adult rat offspring. *PLoS One* 5, e15558 (2010).
- 118. Ibáñez, L., Potau, N., Enriquez, G. & De Zegher, F. Reduced uterine and ovarian size in adolescent girls born small for gestational age. *Pediatr. Res.* 47, 575–577 (2000).
- 119. Chan, K. A., Jazwiec, P. A., Gohir, W., Petrik, J. J. & Sloboda, D. M. Maternal nutrient restriction impairs young adult offspring ovarian signaling resulting in reproductive dysfunction and follicle loss. *Biol. Reprod.* **98**, 664–682 (2018).
- 120. Vikström, J., Hammar, M., Josefsson, A., Bladh, M. & Sydsjö, G. Birth characteristics in a clinical sample of

women seeking infertility treatment: a case-control study. *BMJ Open.* **4**, e004197 (2014).

- Ibáñez, L. et al. Reduced ovulation rate in adolescent girls born small for gestational age. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 87, 3391–3393 (2002).
- Ibáñez, L. et al. Hypersecretion of FSH in infant boys and girls born small for gestational age. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 87, 1986–1988 (2002).
- 123. McCarthy, M. M., Herold, K. & Stockman, S. L. Fast, furious and enduring: sensitive versus critical periods in sexual differentiation of the brain. *Physiol. Behav.* 187, 13–19 (2018).
- 124. Styne, D. M. & Grumbach, M. M. Physiology and disorders of puberty. *Pediatr. Ann.* 41, e73–e80 (2012).
- 125. Kuiri-Hänninen, T., Sankilampi, U. & Dunkel, L. Activation of the hypothalamic-pituitary-gonadal axis in infancy: minipuberty. *Horm. Res. Paediatr.* 82, 73–80 (2014).
- 126. Witchel, S. F. & Topaloglu, A. K. in Yen & Jaffe's Reproductive Endocrinology (ed. Strauss, J. & Barbieri, R.) 394–446 (Elsevier, 2018).
- 127. Kaplan, S. L., Grumbach, M. M. & Aubert, M. L. The ontogenesis of pituitary hormones and hypothalamic factors in the human fetus: maturation of central nervous system regulation of anterior pituitary function. *Recent. Prog. Horm. Res.* **32**, 161–243 (1976).
- Corbier, P. et al. Sex differences in serum luteinizing hormone and testosterone in the human neonate during the first few hours after birth. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 71, 1344–1348 (1990).
- 129. De Zegher, F., Devlieger, H. & Veldhuis, J. D. Pulsatile and sexually dimorphic secretion of luteinizing hormone in the human infant on the day of birth. *Pediatr. Res.* **32**, 605–607 (1992).
- Clarkson, J. & Herbison, A. E. Hypothalamic control of the male neonatal testosterone surge. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* 371, 20150115 (2016).
- 131. Iwasa, T. et al. Effects of intrauterine undernutrition on hypothalamic Kiss1 expression and the timing of puberty in female rats. *J. Physiol.* 588, 821–829 (2010).
- 132. Castellano, J. M. et al. Early metabolic programming of puberty onset: impact of changes in postnatal feeding and rearing conditions on the timing of puberty and development of the hypothalamic kisspeptin system. *Endocrinology* **152**, 3396–3408 (2011).
- 133. Caron, E., Ciofi, P., Prevot, V. & Bouret, S. G. Alteration in neonatal nutrition causes perturbations in hypothalamic neural circuits controlling reproductive function. *J. Neurosci.* **32**, 11486–11494 (2012).
- 134. Kiviranta, P. et al. Transient postnatal gonadal activation and growth velocity in infancy. *Pediatrics* 138, e20153561 (2016).
- 135. Becker, M. et al. Hormonal 'minipuberty' influences the somatic development of boys but not of girls up to the age of 6 years. *Clin. Endocrinol.* 83, 694–701 (2015).
- 136. Savulescu, D. et al. Conadotropin-releasing hormoneregulated prohibitin mediates apoptosis of the gonadotrope cells. *Mol. Endocrinol.* 27, 1856–1870 (2013).
- Childs, G., Ellison, D., Foster, L. & Ramaley, J. Postnatal maturation of gonadotropes in the male rat pituitary. *Endocrinology* **109**, 1683–1692 (1981).
 Alvergne, A., Faurie, C. & Raymond, M.
- 138. Alvergne, A., Faurie, C. & Raymond, M. Developmental plasticity of human reproductive development: effects of early family environment in modern-day France. *Physiol. Behav.* **95**, 625–632 (2008).
- 139. Culpin, I. et al. Father absence and timing of menarche in adolescent girls from a UK cohort: the mediating role of maternal depression and major financial problems. J. Adolesc. **37**, 291–301 (2014).
- 140. Élias, S. G., van Noord, P. A. H., Peeters, P. H. M., den Tonkelaar, I. & Grobbee, D. E. Caloric restriction reduces age at menopause. *Menopause* 25, 1232–1237 (2018).
- 141. Juul, A. & Skakkebæk, N. E. Why do normal children have acromegalic levels of IGF-I during puberty? *J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab.* **104**, 2770–2776 (2019).
- 142. Navarro, V. M. & Tena-Sempere, M. Neuroendocrine control by kisspeptins: role in metabolic regulation of fertility. *Nat. Rev. Endocrinol.* 8, 40–53 (2012).
- 143. McCarthy, H. D., Cole, T. J., Fry, T., Jebb, S. A. & Prentice, A. M. Body fat reference curves for children. *Int. J. Obes.* **30**, 598–602 (2006).

- 144. Prough, R. A., Clark, B. J. & Klinge, C. M. Novel mechanisms for DHEA action. J. Mol. Endocrinol. 56, R139–R155 (2016).
- 145. Casson, P. R., Lindsay, M. S., Pisarska, M. D., Carson, S. A. & Buster, J. E. Dehydroepiandrosterone supplementation augments ovarian stimulation in poor responders: a case series. *Hum. Reprod.* 15, 2129–2132 (2000).
- 146. Gleicher, N. & Barad, D. H. Dehydroepiandrosterone (DHEA) supplementation in diminished ovarian reserve (DOR). *Reprod. Biol. Endocrinol.* 9, 67 (2011).
- (DOR). Reprod. Biol. Endocrinol. 9, 67 (2011).
 147. Zhu, J., Kusa, T. O. & Chan, Y.-M. Genetics of pubertal timing. Curr. Opin. Pediatr. 30, 1 (2018).
 148. Gajbhiye, R., Fung, J. N. & Montgomery, G. W.
- 148. Gajoniye, R., Fung, J. N. & Montgomery, G. W. Complex genetics of female fertility. *NPJ Genom. Med.* 3, 29 (2018).
- 149. Abreu, A. P. et al. Central precocious puberty caused by mutations in the imprinted gene MKRN3. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 368, 2467–2475 (2013).
- 150. De Vries, L., Gat-Yablonski, G., Dror, N., Singer, A. & Phillip, M. A novel MKRN3 missense mutation causing familial precocious puberty. *Hum. Reprod.* 29, 2838–2843 (2014).
- Bessa, D. S. et al. High frequency of MKRN3 mutations in male central precocious puberty previously classified as idiopathic. *Neuroendocrinology* **105**, 17–25 (2017).
- 152. Macedo, D. B. et al. Central precocious puberty that appears to be sporadic caused by paternally inherited mutations in the imprinted gene makorin ring finger 3. *J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab.* **99**, E1097–E1103 (2014).
- 153. Hershko, A., Razin, A. & Shemer, R. Imprinted methylation and its effect on expression of the mouse Zfp127 gene. *Gene* 234, 323–327 (1999).
- 154. Dauber, A. et al. Paternally inherited DLK1 deletion associated with familial central precocious puberty. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 102, 1557–1567 (2017).
- 155. Gomes, L. G. et al. DLK1 is a novel link between reproduction and metabolism. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 104, 2112–2120 (2019).
- Perry, J. R. B. et al. Parent-of-origin-specific allelic associations among 106 genomic loci for age at menarche. *Nature* 514, 92–97 (2014).
- Day, F. R. et al. Genomic analyses identify hundreds of variants associated with age at menarche and support a role for puberty timing in cancer risk. *Nat. Genet.* 49, 834–841 (2017).
 Howard, S. R. et al. Contributions of function-altering
- 158. Howard, S. R. et al. Contributions of function-altering variants in genes implicated in pubertal timing and body mass for self-limited delayed puberty. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. **103**, 649–659 (2018).
- Endocrinol. Metab. 103, 649–659 (2018).
 159. Avendaño, M. S., Vazquez, M. J. & Tena-Sempere, M. Disentangling puberty: novel neuroendocrine pathways and mechanisms for the control of mammalian puberty. *Hum. Reprod. Update* 23, 737–763 (2017).
- 160. Elks, C. E. et al. Thirty new loci for age at menarche identified by a meta-analysis of genome-wide association studies. *Nat. Genet.* 42, 1077–1085 (2010).
- Altarejos, J. Y. et al. The Creb1 coactivator Crtc1 is required for energy balance and fertility. *Nat. Med.* 14, 1112–1117 (2008).
- 162. Altarejos, J. Y. & Montminy, M. CREB and the CRTC co-activators: sensors for hormonal and metabolic signals. *Nat. Rev. Mol. Cell Biol.* **12**, 141–151 (2011).
- 163. Kim, C. H. et al. Leptin recruits Creb-regulated transcriptional coactivator 1 to improve hyperglycemia in insulin-deficient diabetes. *Mol. Metab.* 4, 227–236 (2015).
- 164. Pnueli, L., Luo, M., Wang, S., Naor, Z. & Melamed, P. Calcineurin mediates the gonadotropin-releasing hormone effect on expression of both subunits of the follicle-stimulating hormone through distinct mechanisms. *Mol. Cell. Biol.* **31**, 5023–5036 (2011).
- 165. Jeong, H. et al. Sirt1 mediates neuroprotection from mutant huntingtin by activation of the TORC1 and CREB transcriptional pathway. *Nat. Med.* 18, 159–165 (2012).
- 166. Castellano, J. M. & Tena-Sempere, M. Metabolic control of female puberty: potential therapeutic targets. *Expert Opin. Ther. Targets* **20**, 1181–1193 (2016).
- 167. van der Knaap, J. A. & Verrijzer, C. P. Undercover: gene control by metabolites and metabolic enzymes. *Genes Dev.* **30**, 2345–2369 (2016).
- Nieborak, A. & Schneider, R. Metabolic intermediates cellular messengers talking to chromatin modifiers. *Mol. Metab.* 14, 39–52 (2018).

- 169. Li, X., Egervari, G., Wang, Y., Berger, S. L. & Lu, Z. Regulation of chromatin and gene expression by metabolic enzymes and metabolites. *Nat. Rev. Mol. Cell Biol.* **19**, 563–578 (2018).
- 170. Herbison, A. E. Control of puberty onset and fertility by gonadotropin-releasing hormone neurons. *Nat. Rev. Endocrinol.* **12**, 452–466 (2016).
- Abreu, A. P. & Kaiser, U. B. Pubertal development and regulation. *Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol.* 4, 254–264 (2016).
- Plant, T. M. Neuroendocrine control of the onset of puberty. *Front. Neuroendocrinol.* 38, 73–88 (2015).
- 173. Lomniczi, A. et al. Epigenetic control of female puberty. *Nat. Neurosci.* **16**, 281–289 (2013).
- 174. Laukka, T. et al. Fumarate and succinate regulate expression of hypoxia-inducible genes via TET enzymes. J. Biol. Chem. 291, 4256–4265 (2016).
- 175. Xu, W. et al. Oncometabolite 2-hydroxyglutarate is a competitive inhibitor of α-ketoglutaratedependent dioxygenases. *Cancer Cell* **19**, 17–30 (2011).
- 176. Kelseý, M. M. et al. Menstrual dysfunction in girls from the treatment options for type 2 diabetes in adolescents and youth (TODAY) study. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 103, 2509–2318 (2018).
- Struhl, K. & Segal, E. Determinants of nucleosome positioning. *Nat. Struct. Mol. Biol.* 20, 267–273 (2013).
- 178. Rudnizky, S. et al. Nucleosome mobility and the regulation of gene expression: insights from singlemolecule studies. *Protein Sci.* 26, 1266–1277 (2017).
- 179. Fierz, B. & Poirier, M. G. Biophysics of chromatin dynamics. *Annu. Rev. Biophys.* **48**, 321–345 (2019).
- 180. Zhou, K., Gaullier, C. & Luger, K. Nucleosome structure and dynamics are coming of age. *Nat. Struct. Mol. Biol.* **26**, 3–13 (2019).
- Melamed, P., Yosefzon, Y., Rudnizky, S. & Pnueli, L. Transcriptional enhancers: transcription, function and flexibility. *Transcription* 7, 26–31 (2016).
 Klemm, S. L., Shipony, Z. & Greenleaf, W. J. Chromatin
- 182. Klemm, S. L., Shipony, Z. & Greenleaf, W. J. Chromatin accessibility and the regulatory epigenome. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 20, 207–220 (2019).
- 183. Melamed, P. et al. Multifaceted targeting of the chromatin mediates gonadotropin-releasing hormone effects on gene expression in the gonadotrope. *Front. Endocrinol.* **9**, 58 (2018).
- Melamed, P. Histone deacetylases and repression of the gonadotropin genes. *Trends Endocrinol. Metab.* 19, 25–31 (2008).
- 185. Oride, A., Kanasaki, H., Mijiddorj, T., Sukhbaatar, U. & Miyazaki, K. Trichostatin A specifically stimulates gonadotropin FSHβ gene expression in gonadotroph LβT2 cells. *Endocr. J.* 61, 335–342 (2014).
- 186. Mijiddorj, T. et al. Retinoic acid and retinaldehyde dehydrogenase are not involved in the specific induction of the follicle-stimulating hormone β subunit by trichostatin A, a selective inhibitor of histone deacetylase. *Gen. Comp. Endocrinol.* **242**, 59–65 (2017).
- 187. Lappalainen, T. & Greally, J. M. Associating cellular epigenetic models with human phenotypes. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 18, 441–451 (2017).
- Almstrup, K. et al. Pubertal development in healthy children is mirrored by DNA methylation patterns in peripheral blood. *Sci. Rep.* 6, 28657 (2016).
- 189. Thompson, E. E. et al. Global DNA methylation changes spanning puberty are near predicted estrogen-responsive genes and enriched for genes involved in endocrine and immune processes. *Clin. Epigenetics* **10**, 62 (2018).
- 190. Bessa, D. S. et al. Methylome profiling of healthy and central precocious puberty girls. *Clin. Epigenetics* **10**, 146 (2018).
- 191. Issa, J.-P. Aging and epigenetic drift: a vicious cycle. J. Clin. Invest. **124**, 24–29 (2014).
- 192. Hernando-Herraez, I. et al. Ageing affects DNA methylation drift and transcriptional cell-to-cell variability in mouse muscle stem cells. *Nat. Commun.* **10**, 4361 (2019).
- 193. Horvath, S. & Raj, K. DNA methylation-based biomarkers and the epigenetic clock theory of ageing. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* **19**, 371–384 (2018).
- Horvath, S. DNA methylation age of human tissues and cell types. *Genome Biol.* 14, R115 (2013).
 Jones, M. J., Goodman, S. J. & Kobor, M. S. DNA
- 195. Jones, M. J., Goodman, S. J. & Kobor, M. S. DNA methylation and healthy human aging. *Aging Cell* 14, 924–932 (2015).

- 196. Quach, A. et al. Epigenetic clock analysis of diet, exercise, education, and lifestyle factors. *Aging* 9, 419–446 (2017).
- Field, A. E. et al. DNA methylation clocks in aging: categories, causes, and consequences. *Mol. Cell* 71, 882–895 (2018).
- Lu, A. T. et al. DNA methylation GrimAge strongly predicts lifespan and healthspan. *Aging* **11**, 303–327 (2019).
- 199. Binder, A. M. et al. Faster ticking rate of the epigenetic clock is associated with faster pubertal development in girls. *Epigenetics* **13**, 85–94 (2018).
- 200. Ryan, C. P. et al. Reproduction predicts shorter telomeres and epigenetic age acceleration among young adult women. *Sci. Rep.* 8, 11100 (2018).
- Huang, Y.-T. et al. Epigenome-wide profiling of DNA methylation in paired samples of adipose tissue and blood. *Epigenetics* 11, 227–236 (2016).
- Braun, P. R. et al. Genome-wide DNA methylation comparison between live human brain and peripheral tissues within individuals. *Transl. Psychiatry* 9, 47 (2019).
- Wen, S. et al. Functional characterization of genetically labeled gonadotropes. *Endocrinology* 149, 2701–2711 (2008).
- 204. Bellofiore, N. et al. First evidence of a menstruating rodent: the spiny mouse (*Acomys cahirinus*). *Am. J. Obstet. Gynecol.* **216**, 40.e1–40.e11 (2017).
- 205. Greaves, R. F. et al. A tale of two steroids: the importance of the androgens DHEA and DHEAS for early neurodevelopment. J. Steroid Biochem. Mol. Biol. 188, 77–85 (2019).
- 206. Ezran, C. et al. The mouse lemur, a genetic model organism for primate biology, behavior, and health. *Genetics* 206, 651–664 (2017).
- Roberts, L. Small, furry and powerful: are mouse lemurs the next big thing in genetics? *Nature* 570, 151–154 (2019).
- Pulecio, J., Verma, N., Mejĭa-Ramírez, E., Huangfu, D. & Raya, A. CRISPR/Cas9-based engineering of the epigenome. *Cell Stem Cell* 21, 431–447 (2017).
- 209. Holtzman, L & Gersbach, C. A. Editing the epigenome: reshaping the genomic landscape. Annu. Rev. Genomics Hum. Genet. 19, 43–71 (2018).
- Gomez, J. A., Beitnere, U. & Segal, D. J. Live-animal epigenome editing: convergence of novel techniques. *Trends Genet.* 35, 527–541 (2019).
- Trends Genet. 35, 527–541 (2019).
 Hall, M. A. et al. High-resolution dynamic mapping of histone-DNA interactions in a nucleosome. *Nat. Struct. Mol. Biol.* 16, 124–129 (2009).
- Rudnizky, S. et al. Single-molecule DNA unzipping reveals asymmetric modulation of a transcription factor by its binding site sequence and context. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 46, 1513–1524 (2018).
- 213. Johnson, P. L., Wood, J. W. & Weinstein, M. Female fecundity in highland Papua New Guinea. *Soc. Biol.* 37, 26–43 (1990).
- 214. Nepomnaschy, P. A., Welch, K., McConnell, D., Strassmann, B. I. & England, B. G. Stress and female reproductive function: a study of daily variations in cortisol, gonadotrophins, and gonadal steroids in a rural Mayan population. *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* 16, 523–532 (2004).
- Murphy, S. A., Bentley, G. R. & O'Hanesian, M. A. An analysis for menstrual data with time-varying covariates. *Stat. Med.* 14, 1843–1857 (1995).
- Jasieńska, G. & Ellison, P. T. Physical work causes suppression of ovarian function in women. *Proc. R. Soc. London Ser. B Biol. Sci.* 265, 1847–1851 (1998).
- Panter-Brick, C., Lotstein, D. S. & Ellison, P. T. Seasonality of reproductive function and weight loss in rural Nepali women. *Hum. Reprod.* 8, 684–690 (1993).
- McCarthy, M. M., Nugent, B. M. & Lenz, K. M. Neuroimmunology and neuroepigenetics in the establishment of sex differences in the brain. *Nat. Rev. Neurosci.* 18, 471–484 (2017).
 Melamed, P., Yosefzon, Y., David, C., Tsukerman, A. &
- Melamed, P., Yosefzon, Y., David, C., Tsukerman, A. & Pnueli, L. Tet enzymes, variants, and differential effects on function. *Front. Cell Dev. Biol.* 6, 22 (2018).
- Lai, W. K. M. & Pugh, B. F. Understanding nucleosome dynamics and their links to gene expression and DNA replication. *Nat. Rev. Mol. Cell Biol.* 18, 548–562 (2017).
- Weber, C. M. & Henikoff, S. Histone variants: dynamic punctuation in transcription. *Genes. Dev.* 28, 672–682 (2014).
- Buschbeck, M. & Hake, S. B. Variants of core histones and their roles in cell fate decisions, development and cancer. *Nat. Rev. Mol. Cell Biol.* 18, 299–314 (2017).

223. Tessarz, P. & Kouzarides, T. Histone core modifications regulating nucleosome structure and dynamics. *Nat. Rev. Mol. Cell Biol.* **15**, 703–708 (2014).

224. Zheng, H. & Xie, W. The role of 3D genome organization in development and cell differentiation. *Nat. Rev. Mol. Cell Biol.* **20**, 535–550 (2019).

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by grants from BBSRC/ESRC (grant ES/N000471/1 to G.R.B., R.S. and P.M.) and Israel

Science Foundation (grants 1850/17 to P.M. and 1782/17 to A.K.).

Author contributions B.B.-S., S.R., L.P., C.R.B., R.S. and A.K. researched data for the article and contributed to discussion of the content. P.M. wrote the article with considerable input from G.R.B., R.S. and A.K. All authors reviewed and/or edited the manuscript before submission.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Peer review information

Nature Reviews Endocrinology thanks P. Gluckman and the anonymous reviewer(s) for their contribution to the peer review of this work.

Publisher's note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

© Springer Nature Limited 2020